Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology Working Papers

MAX-PLANCK-GESELLSCHAFT

Working Paper No. 111

Friederike Fleischer

Between Technology of Self and Technology of Power: the volunteer phenomenon in Guangzhou, China

Halle/Saale 2009
ISSN 1615-4568

Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology, PO Box 110351,
06017 Halle/Saale, Phone: +49 (0)345 2927-0, Fax: +49 (0)345 2927-402,
http://www.eth.mpg.de, e-mail: workingpaper@eth.mpg.de

Between Technology of Self and Technology of Power: the volunteer phenomenon in Guangzhou, China[1]

Friederike Fleischer[2]

Abstract

Based on interviews and survey data with young people in Guangzhou, in this article I explore the recent popularity of volunteer work in China. I delineate several factors that play into the phenomenon, such as students' desire to break out of their strict routines, to engage in meaningful activities, to meet and interact with more people, and to contribute to China's development. By linking these issues to the socio-political, economic, and ideological transformations in China, I show that we cannot meaningfully distinguish between altruistic and self-interested motivations to volunteer. For the students, whom my research focused on, I suggest that volunteering is a means to transform themselves into modern, entrepreneurial, and responsible selves, necessary to meet the challenges of urban life in China today. At the same time, volunteering, encouraged and framed by the government, is a "technology of power" in the Foucaultdian sense, that is, a means to nurture self-reliant and socially responsible individuals, necessary for the functioning of the reformed state. In effect, volunteerism is a locus where technologies of the self and 'governmentality' converge.

[1] This working paper is part of my larger research project "Soup, Love, and a 'Helping Hand'. Issues of Social Support in Guangzhou, China," at the Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology, Halle/Saale, Germany. I would like to thank Professor Ma Guoqing at my host institution, the Department of Anthropology at Sun Yatsen University in Guangzhou, for his support throughout the fieldwork. I greatly appreciate the insightful comments on earlier drafts of this paper by colleagues in the Writing-up Seminar in Department II Socialist and Postsocialist Eurasia at the MPI as well as by the participants of the conference *Who Cares ... And How? An anthropological inquiry into support* held at the MPI, July 2008. I would also like to thank Tatjana Thelen and Jarrett Zigon for their helpful suggestions on how to revise the working paper for publication.

[2] Friederike Fleischer is research fellow, Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology, Advokatenweg 36, D–06114 Halle, Germany; e-mail: fleischer@eth.mpg.de.

Introduction

Almost every person under the age of 30 with whom I talked during my research in Guangzhou said to be a volunteer.[3] Nationwide, the Chinese government claims that more than 100 million people have been involved in volunteer activities in recent years.[4] Guangdong province, one of the birthplaces of volunteer service in the reform period, registered over one million volunteers in 2005 (Tan 2006). In a country where social relations and care are said to include only family and close friends, the inner circle, but not strangers (Madge 1974, Tang 2005); where the reforms have allegedly triggered a dramatic rise of individualisation and materialism resulting in a moral vacuum and a lack of solidarity (Wang 2002, Zhuo 2001); and where high competition and the one-child policy are claimed to produce "little emperors," i.e. spoiled and egotistic youngsters (Chandler 2004),[5] these numbers are truly intriguing. Moreover, studies in post-communist Central and Eastern Europe suggest that the process of democratisation and the establishment of civil society are crucial factors for the rise of volunteerism (Juknevičius and Savicka 2003, Ślęzak 2005). In China, however, the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) still holds power, and while the government shows a positive attitude towards the third sector, its development is still limited and remains under control. The question thus arises: who are the volunteers? What motivates them? And how do we explain the sudden rise of volunteerism?

Analyses of volunteerism frequently distinguish dimensions and clusters of motivations, dividing them into altruistic and self-interested categories. Adloff and Sigmund call voluntary work, the spending of time and effort on strangers, a form of "gift economy", a donation "par excellence" (Adloff and Sigmund 2005: 211). In this sense, we could understand volunteer work as the ultimate altruistic form of support – unconditioned, disinterested, and non-measured – but is it really? The debate about the gift and reciprocity goes back to the foundations of anthropology. From Malinowski's description of the *kula* ring to Mauss' gift, Durkheim's notions of organic and mechanic solidarity to rational choice theories of altruism, the question of why and under which conditions people support each other and give remains a central question in the discipline. Based on about 20 interviews and a set of 42 questionnaires[6] with young volunteers in Guangzhou, in this paper I explore these issues by linking my case study to the larger issues of socio-political, economic, and ideological transformations in China. I delineated several, intricately linked factors that contribute to the volunteer phenomenon, such as socialising, search for meaning, and nationalism, and I show that there are no clear-cut and meaningful distinctions between altruistic and self-interested motivations. For the student volunteers, whom my research focused on, I suggest that an important dimension of the experience is its transformative character. Through the volunteer activities they form new modern selves. At the same time, however, volunteerism, encouraged and framed by the government, is a "technology of power" (Foucault 1980), a means to nurture self-reliant and socially responsible individuals, necessary for the functioning of the

[3] Fieldwork was carried out between September 2006 and September 2007 in Guangzhou, China.

[4] Reliable numbers about volunteers in China are hard to find: people might volunteer once but never come back, while others might not be registered as regular members of an organisation. In addition, what is subsumed under 'volunteer work' in Chinese refers to any kind of non-remunerated activity, including, for example, volunteering in sport events such as the 2008 Olympic Games. Moreover, companies today frequently ask their staff to 'volunteer', which questions the prerequisite of 'free' and 'individual' efforts in a Western understanding of volunteer work. I will discuss some statistics below.

[5] See Fong (2004) for a critical analysis of this perception.

[6] In addition, I obtained the results of an online survey in which 300 members of the Serving Team (*qizhi fuwu dui*) of the Guangzhou Youth Volunteer Association (*Guangzhou qingnian zhiyuanzhe xiehui*) took part.

reformed state. This process is also fed by recent discourses about self-development and 'quality' of Chinese citizens. In effect, volunteerism is a locus where technologies of the self and 'governmentality' converge. Importantly, however, the phenomenon is constituted in and through social relationships – with 'clients', other volunteers, volunteer organisations, relatives, the public, the state etc. – and thus negotiated and processual. Based on my case studies in Guangzhou, China, in this article I therefore attempt to show that volunteering, and other forms of support, are multifarious, complex phenomena. Distinctions between altruistic and self-interested motivations are as misleading as are those between state- and society-based kinds of support. Volunteering and support should be understood as time- and place-specific, embedded complexes of processual relations that involve different agents with different intentions. The outcome of volunteering (and support in general) is moreover not dependent on specific motivations.

Below, I will first give a brief account of the history of philanthropy, charity, volunteerism, and social relations in China. In the second section of this paper I present statistical data about volunteering in China today, for both the national level and Guangzhou. What follows is a brief description of the two volunteer organisations my informants belonged to. In the main part of the paper I draw on my data from interviews and the survey to discuss volunteers' inspirations and motivations and to show the interconnectedness of various contributing factors. The next section highlights the transformative character of volunteerism that 'produces' new, modern selves and subjects. The paper concludes with a discussion of volunteering as a form of support.

Philanthropy, Charity, Volunteerism, and Social Relations in China

Social relations in China are said to be dominated by those among family and close friends. Within the tightly knit network of relations, an inner circle of family and friends is sharply distinguished from strangers. Social obligations and trust extend only to the inner circle, one's "own people", but not to strangers (Tang 2005). This is commonly explained by Confucian ideology, which emphasises patrilinear family relations and obligations and uses filial piety to reinforce obligations in the younger generation towards the elder.[7] Charity and philanthropy, nevertheless, have a long tradition in China. 'Charity' (*cishan*) in Chinese means 'mercy' and 'benevolence'; it emphasises goodwill and generosity, not entitlements. Confucian (and Buddhist) teachings emphasise benevolence or philanthropy as ideals that at least the elite-literati class should strive for. In imperial times, due to the general family-orientation, however, such support and welfare was mainly distributed among the community, the clan, and kin (which, in China's south, were most often synonymous). Especially in the countryside, community-based mutual assistance played a vital role, since no social security net existed and government relief funds were often insufficient. Thus, historically there existed farmland, schools, and temples organised by communities, village heads, or religious groups. In addition, already in the Tang period (618–907) craftsmen guilds had been formed that protected their interests and coordinated their internal and external relationships. When mobility greatly increased during the Ming dynasty (1368–1644), migrating fellow villagers and townsmen often organised cliques or guild halls for mutual help and self-defence. These forms

[7] Stafford (2000) criticises this position for overemphasising patrilineal relations while neglecting the importance of the cycles of *yang lao* (parent – child relationship) and *laiwang* (relationships between friends, neighbours, and acquaintances).

of support, however, never extended beyond the social realm of local and/ or professional association.

The early twentieth century brought Western-style volunteer organisations to China that engaged in relief work with refugees and the poor.[8] In addition, during the Nationalist regime (1911–1949), the government and privately created third sector organisations engaged in commercial, academic, professional, public-welfare, philanthropic, religious, and other activities to assist the government agencies. This early twentieth century effort in philanthropic work was renewed after World War II, but came to an end with China's 'closing' to the outside world. Instead, the communist government sought to stimulate volunteer work, most prominently through the "Learn from Comrade Lei Feng" campaign in the 1960s.[9] This and other communist movements to encourage help and support for others were large, politicised, collective campaigns, participation in these was less voluntary but rather coerced. At the same time, while the communist regime aimed at forging new, revolutionary social relations based on a strong allegiance to the Party after 1949, the realities of socialist everyday life could not transcend the importance of the family. It remained the basic unit of society and a vital 'resource'.[10] In many ways, the Cultural Revolution reinforced this trend, even if some families were also disrupted by it. An entire generation allegedly lost their ability to trust strangers and even neighbours due to their experience of punishment and betrayal.[11]

Since 1978, economic reforms (cutting costs in the state sector, profitability requirements, emergence of an urban labour market, etc.) have led to growing socio-economic stratifications, individualisation, separation of families into nuclear entities, and emerging generational gaps. On the one hand, this could be expected to result in a weakening of family relations. On the other, greater uncertainties concomitantly with reduction of state support have actually increased the necessity and logic of relying on the family for support. This process was encouraged by a revival of Confucianism through the government to support/justify the state sector reforms and the proclaimed "return to the family" as a source of support (Whyte 1997). To mobilise mutual care and help among the 'masses' the government also revitalised "Learn from Lei Feng" in the 1980s. As one outcome of this effort, and influenced by Western organisations, notably from Hong Kong, the first volunteer organisation was set up in Shenzhen in 1990. Soon after, various kinds of groups and organisations sprang up all over the country.

In the midst of the social and economic reforms, the government quickly realised the potential of volunteer organisations. The Ministry of Civil Affairs thus tried to promote community volunteer services and the Chinese Youth League (*Zhongguo gongchanzhuyi qingniantuan*, or *gongqingtuan*) encouraged youth volunteer services. In 1994, the Chinese Young Volunteers Association (*Zhongguo qingnian zhiyuanzhe xiehui*) was officially established and large volunteering programmes were initiated. At the same time, international volunteer organisations were given permission to launch programmes in China, the United Nations began to send volunteers, and

[8] During the Qing period (1644–1911) there also existed various religious charity and philanthropic organisations, many of them run by foreign missionaries.

[9] Orphaned at an early age and raised under communist tutelage, Lei was a soldier who was killed in an accident at age 22. After his death, Lei's life was stylised into an example of selflessness and devotion. He became the moral model for all Chinese. March 5th was declared "Learn from Lei Feng Day", on which schools and work-units organised teams to perform voluntary services for the public (see Ding 2005).

[10] The 1950s Marriage Law, for example, held adult children responsible for supporting their elderly parents. In addition, the lack of available housing, plus a steep seniority system that guaranteed parents higher wages and better access to resources, turned them into an important source of support.

[11] Studies show that the generation most affected by this movement significantly lacks trust beyond family and close friends. See, for example, Tang 2005.

grass-root volunteer groups began to carry out various activities. In 1999, March 5th, previously the National Day for Learning from Lei Feng, was renamed the National Volunteers Day (Ding 2005).

Despite these efforts, Chinese scholars have diagnosed a lack of moral values in society as a result of the dramatic transformations of the last 30 years. Zhuo (2001), for example, notes that in contemporary China many people are puzzled as to what kind of moral attitude they should have in facing growing individualism and egocentrism:

> "In the social transformation of contemporary China, there is obviously a crisis of cognition in morality. With the emphasis on individual personality, the collective responsibility and moral coherence are to a certain extent swept away. Man considers only the 'self-realization' of individuals, and the collective morality is in this context no more than a 'utopian vapour'" (Zhuo 2001: 35).

Similarly, Wang (2002) describes how the reform period has hastened the collapse of the communist moral order of the Maoist era and observes that no new moral order has arisen to fill the gap. The continuing invocation of socialist or communist values in an increasingly capitalist society has deepened cynicism, allowing neither socialist values nor capitalist ones to gain a firm foothold and help reconstitute self and society in post-Mao China. The consequence is a moral and ideological vacuum or disjunction.

Given these practices of social interaction and the diagnosed state of anomie, the questions arise, where did young people get the idea to volunteer? And who or what motivated them to volunteer?

Volunteers, Numbers, and Organisations

According to a recent study (Ding and Jiang 2001), 769.57 million Chinese aged 18 and above (85.2 per cent of the corresponding population segment) volunteered in 2001, with each volunteer contributing an average of 77 hours during the year. It is important to note, however, that only 10.9 per cent (about 83.9 million) of these people volunteered frequently. Moreover, many Chinese in this study do not volunteer entirely at their own decision: 81.3 per cent of the volunteers (approximately 625.6 million) said they were required to do so by the leadership of their work units or government agencies.[12] In 2001, this was the most common way of becoming a volunteer or participating in "a volunteer activity".

Young people are more likely to volunteer: the rate of volunteering was 90.6 per cent for those aged 18 to 24, 86.4 per cent for those aged 25 to 34, and 85.2 per cent for those aged 35 to 44. Women and men volunteered almost with the same frequency (85.4 per cent and 85.2 per cent, respectively), yet men contributed more time: 94 hours per year as opposed to 61 hours for women. Volunteer rates and volunteer hours generally increased with level of education; university students/graduates contributed the most.

People with a political background, like members of the Chinese Communist Party (90.2 per cent), the Chinese Youth League (91.1 per cent) and other state organizations (89.5 per cent), were more likely to volunteer than those who had no political background (78.2 per cent). The second

[12] Another survey conducted by the China Youth Development Research Center (CYDRC) found that 55.4 per cent of young people would volunteer when they were asked to do so by the leadership of their work units. Only 11.6 per cent of respondents volunteered due to personal initiative (see *Asianphilanthropy.org* 2006).

main reason for volunteering was self-motivation (16.3 per cent), the third was invitation by friends (11.5 per cent), and the last being asked by family members (four per cent).

The reason most frequently given by volunteers for not volunteering, or not volunteering more, was not being organisationally asked (26.1 per cent). 16.9 per cent of the volunteers stated as the reason why they were not more active as volunteers that they did not have adequate spare time. 14 per cent of the respondents did not know how to get involved. Respondents also suggested that the lack of recognition (71.5 per cent), lack of funds (63.4 per cent), and inadequate management (57 per cent) are hindrances to volunteering (see Ding and Jiang 2001, *Asianphilanthropy.org* 2006).

My own survey data with 42 young volunteers mostly corresponds to the national data.[13] The greatest difference is the number of female informants (31) as opposed to male (11). Respondents were between 15 and 29 years old, with the majority (92.9 per cent) between 20 and 24 years. None of them were married. While 13 (more than a quarter) had no siblings, 14 had one, and 10 had two siblings. Five had even more. This can be explained by their places of birth: 27 came from Guangdong province, that is, they probably had a rural *hukou* (registration) which allowed parents to have more than one child. Only nine were from Guangzhou, and six from other provinces.

90.5 per cent (38) of the respondents were students. One worked in a state enterprise, two in private enterprises, and one in part time and odd jobs. Their fathers' occupations were diverse: 14 (of 39 responses) were self-employed, seven worked in government enterprises or institutes, four worked as private enterprise employees, four in part time or odd jobs, and one in a foreign or joint venture enterprise. Two fathers had been laid off (*xiagang*). Combined monthly household income was comparatively high:[14] two of 39 respondents reported incomes below RMB 1,000; 17 between RMB 1000 to 3000; 14 between RMB 3000 to 5000; 4 between RMB 5000 to 7000; one between RMB 7000 and 9000, and one more than RMB 9000.

Respondents had all started volunteering fairly recently. Three had started less than one month ago; eight between one and six months ago; 16 between six and 12 months ago; four one to 18 months years ago; five 18 months to two years ago; five two to three years ago. One respondent had been a volunteer for three years or longer. 32 of the respondents (76.2 per cent) were active volunteers, while four had volunteered in the past. Six of the respondents were interested in volunteering. These results are not surprising since the questionnaires were administered to people known as volunteers. Two respondents volunteered once per week, 15 once per month, and seven several times a year. 17 did not volunteer regularly but had done so once or twice.

Interesting is also the amount of time respondents spent volunteering per month: 22 respondents (52.4 per cent) volunteered less than 10 hours, 10 between 11 and 20 hours, and two between 26 and 40 hours. Three respondents had volunteered one day, four several days, and one less than a week.[15]

---

[13] About half of the questionnaires were administered directly and half were sent out by email. Respondents were members of the NGO "Joy-in-Action" (JIA, see below) or people registered with the Guangzhou Youth Volunteer Association (*Guangzhou qingnian zhiyuanzhe xiehui*).

[14] Guangzhou per capita disposable income for 2005 was RMB 18,287.16 per annum (€1,828.7), i.e. RMB 1,523.93 (€152.39) per month (China Statistics Press 2004 and 2006). Renminbi (RMB) is the currency of PR China. The principal unit is the *yuan*, subdivided into 10 *jiao*, each of 10 *fen*. One Euro trades at approximately 10 RMB.

[15] The apparently similar categories of "several days" and "less than a week" were included because of the JIA work camps (see below) that usually last several consecutive days and up to a week.

Two Volunteer Organisations

The volunteers I interviewed during my research worked for two organisations: the Guangzhou Youth Volunteer Association (*Guangzhou qingnian zhiyuanzhe xiehui*) and "Joy-in-Action" (JIA) – the first being an organisation under the umbrella of the Chinese Youth League and the other a locally self-organised NGO. It is important to stress that, in both organisations, volunteers signed up at their own, completely free will, i.e. they were not coerced or obliged by their employer or other kinds of (state) institutions.

Guangzhou Youth Volunteer Association

Established in 1995, the Guangzhou Youth Volunteer Association (GYVA hereafter) is part of the Communist Youth League of China. The association has several sections, or teams, all of which specialise in a specific area of work: Propaganda and Management Team, Serving Team for the Elderly, Serving Team for Children, Aiding-the-Disabled Team, Medical Team (serving patients), Outreach Team (serving those "who do not behave well"), Sports Serving Team, Legal Aid Team, Culture Serving Team, Community Education Serving Team, IT Professional Team (offering information services). Each of these teams has a group leader. 31 year old Zhang Yu, nicknamed 'Utopia' and a volunteer for seven years, was one of them.

Zhang joined the GYVA after he graduated, when he had a lot of time and felt bored, he said. He also wanted to get to know more people and gain "social experience". After four years, due to his dedication, persistence, and acceptance among other volunteers and clients, Zhang was chosen to become the group leader of a Serving Team. Now he is mainly in charge of managing the group, organising activities, liaising with institutions that request volunteers and with other volunteer organisations. One of his tasks is to hold the introductory sessions for new volunteers.

To join the organisation a person hands in a written application form and pays 15 *yuan* (ca. €1.5). After about a week, a membership card is issued and the new volunteers receive an afternoon of basic training, mainly to introduce the different types of work and some basic behavioural guidelines.[16] My informants generally considered the training unimportant or non-informative. One girl, however, commented negatively on a rule she had been taught, namely, that even if the volunteers were unhappy they should smile once they started their volunteer activities. She and others also remarked that for certain activities, or dealing with some 'clients', they did not receive enough training. While the organisation offered special training, most young volunteers did not have the time (or did not see the necessity) to take part in such voluntary courses. In reality, thus, once the volunteers have attended the afternoon introductory session, they can sign up for any kind of activity they are interested in, all of which can be found online. Volunteers therefore have complete control over the amount of time and type of work they do, and they do not have to attend any other organisational meetings.

Volunteer opportunities are either general tasks, such as an afternoon visit to the elderly in a senior citizens' home or children in an orphanage, or special events, such as a celebration for the disabled, for example. When students knew they had some spare time (usually on the weekend), they checked the organisation's webpage to see what kind of activities were announced. Once they found a suitable and attractive activity, they signed up for it. In the past there was no question that

[16] Training materials are also published on the webpage and volunteers are encouraged to download and study them by themselves.

they would take part in the event once signed up. Today, however, because of the tremendous interest in volunteering (Zhang Yun claimed that 400 to 500 people applied every month), the volunteer has to wait to be chosen by the organiser of the activity. This, according to group leader Zhang Yun, has actually become a bit of a problem: on the one hand, organisers mostly preferred to sign up volunteers they already knew, but on the other, the organisation's mission is to publicise volunteerism, which requires giving newcomers the chance to participate in activities. "If they are not chosen for an activity one or two times, they will lose interest," he said.

As a result of the type of activities and organisation, but also because of the volunteers themselves, very few of the students I talked to worked regularly or over a longer period of time in the same place and with the same people. Signing up at irregular intervals and for various activities, most volunteers did not form close relations with "clients" and did no feel committed to specific institutions. On the contrary, for many students the exploratory nature of their volunteer activities seemed to be part of the attraction. Only recently the Serving Team started a new type of volunteer programme which focuses on specific communities. In this, the *juweihui* (neighbourhood committee) indicates what kind of activities and services it would like the volunteers to offer. Part of the programme is a kind of 'partnership' between the volunteers and the elderly in the community, in which an individual volunteer would always attend to the same person.

No matter what kind of volunteer work was performed, at the end of the activity the organiser notes the time spent on the volunteer's activity card. This card is presented at regular intervals to the organisation, which registers the number of hours and issues certificates of recognition.

Joy-in-Action (JIA)

Joy-in-Action is a China-based NGO that was established in August 2004. The acronym 'JIA' in Chinese means 'family'. The NGO coordinates work camps in Chinese villages affected by Hansen's Disease (HD, leprosy).

In the 1950s and 1960s, the Chinese government relocated people with HD to isolated mountain villages. Today, more than 600 of these villages still exist. Even though villagers have been cured through treatment that became available in the 1980s, they can still not return to their home villages because of the existing stigma. HD-affected people today suffer especially from poor medical treatment, disabilities, poverty, and loneliness. JIA aims to alleviate their suffering through hosting work camps.

JIA works through a network of local units, often located on university campuses. The so-called JIA Work-Camp Coordination Centre provides volunteers with the initial information, training, and networking resources to eventually run the local group self-sufficiently. Once the individual units are up and running, they have minimal contact with the larger organisation, only to receive information material or help if requested. The local groups self-responsibly organise the camps which last one to several days. In JIA's words, campers work "in partnership with the residents of these [HD] villages (…) to improve the villagers' spirits as well as their living conditions and social standing". (*Joy-in-Action,* n.d.)

Sometimes the camps have more specific tasks such as building or improving houses or streets, but most often the visits are merely social. The volunteers organise both educational and recreational activities for children living in the HD villages and try to socialise with grown-ups. Very few of the volunteers have any specific skills, such as medical knowledge, for example, which prevents them from offering more applied services. The main idea behind JIA is to teach the

general population about HD and the discrimination its sufferers have experienced, and to communicate with the people living in the villages to show that they are now accepted by society. One recent and more concrete focus of the group has been to teach children who grew up in the villages and have therefore not received any education to enable them to eventually attend college.[17]

Guangzhou Volunteers

Inspirations

Some informants had already volunteered in middle and/or high school. Most often, however, they were required to volunteer at the time. In recent years, more and more middle and high schools in Guangzhou have added volunteer work to their students' curricula. One combined middle and high school I visited to interview students about their volunteer activity, for example, asked its middle school students to volunteer once per year, and high school students five times per year. Activities such as spending an afternoon visiting the elderly or measuring people's blood pressure on the street were assigned by the school and the students received credits for the work. While the service was officially voluntary, students told me that, besides the credits, they also received certificates for the volunteering work that would count for their graduation exam. "Even though it's voluntary, we *have* to do some volunteer work to graduate." Whether such school activities stimulate students to sign up for volunteer work beyond these requirements, however, is questionable. In a class of 35 high school students, for example, only two continued to volunteer after fulfilling their curricular expectations.

The students' most common source of inspiration, according to my interviews and survey data, was television, especially Hong Kong TV programmes. In addition, students also said that friends had told them about volunteering or that they had simply encountered volunteer activities in the streets. One of the (government encouraged) tasks of volunteer organisations is the popularising of volunteerism. Activities are therefore regularly held in public places. During my time in the field, there were at least four volunteer events organised at a nearby popular public square such as, for example, an afternoon of games for disabled children or dance lessons for the elderly. In addition, at least once a month young volunteers offered to take people's blood pressure, a service especially popular among the elderly. Thus, there are plenty of opportunities to encounter and learn about volunteer work.

The question remains, however, where or how students developed the idea, and the underlying moral notion, to volunteer. None of the volunteering university students I met thought that either teachers or school experiences had influenced them to become volunteers. On the contrary, several informants commented that teachers' slogans calling for social responsibility, solidarity, and volunteer spirit were empty words they did not believe or respect. They showed the same attitude towards government slogans and mostly laughed when I asked them about "building a harmonious society" – the present leadership's mission.[18] Only one student, who aspired to become a member

[17] In the future, JIA also plans to establish work camps dedicated to environmental conservation, the elderly, and the "physically-challenged." See *Joy-in-Action,* n.d.

[18] This observation is supported by research on Chinese youth attitudes such as, for example, by Nesbitt-Larking and Chan (1997). In their studies, the authors found that younger Chinese were substantially more cynical, more individualistic, and more strongly supportive of acts of political protest than their parents' generation. They were also less trustful of the regime and politics in general than their elder compatriots. See also Kwong 1994.

of the CCP, claimed to have been affected by government appeals. “Lei Feng” was mentioned as a source of inspiration by another student. Several, even if they were not religious, referred to Mother Teresa, while others alluded to a relatively vague ‘traditional’ notion of the ‘good person.’ None of these icons, however, were very concrete; to the students they seemed to be simply symbols for altruistic behaviour.

What about young people’s parents? Raised during the Maoists period and socialised through movements such as “Learning from Comrade Lei Feng”, could they have instilled their children with the moral values to help others and to show solidarity with the less fortunate, despite the negative influence of the Cultural Revolution?

Again, I met only one student, Dai Peng (male, age 22), who said that his mother had been an example for him. While she did not know the concept of ‘volunteering’, Dai explained, his mother had always helped neighbours and friends and told Dai to try to help others. At least half of the young volunteers I met, however, actually did not tell their parents about their volunteering activities. “They would not understand” or “they would worry about my studies” were the common explanations for hiding volunteer work from parents. Several students also pointed to the extreme educational and socio-cultural difference between the generations. Especially those with a rural background thought that “my parents are not very educated. They live in the countryside in a small village; they would not understand”. But even students from Guangzhou, whose parents knew of their volunteering, hinted at a generational divide when they commented that “they think it's a waste of time” or “they do not understand why I work for free”. Certainly not all parents, but a large number of them seemed to have different ideas than their children about the importance or value of volunteering.

In sum, there exist multiple ways through which students can learn about volunteer work and be inspired to do so themselves. Apart from the social environment of school and friends, the media and public volunteering events played an important role in instigating volunteerism. Role models, however, did not seem to play an important part in stimulating volunteer work. On the contrary, informants emphasised how it was their own, personal decisions to volunteer, claiming that they had “always” *wanted* to volunteer even before they had encountered a way to do so.

Motivations

Asked what had motivated them to volunteer, almost all my informants (interviewees and survey respondents) said that the initial reason had been very simple: they felt bored, wanted to meet more people, acquire (social) skills, or simply help other people. Longer conversations with them, however, revealed more complicated issues playing into their decision to volunteer, which ranged from rebellion and socialising to search for meaning, nationalist feelings about their country, and a perceived need for self-improvement. All of these themes are intricately linked and cannot easily be separated into altruistic and self-interested motives. In the following I will thus examine motivational factors to volunteer and show their interconnected complexity.

In her study of single children in Dalian, China, Vanessa Fong (2004) vividly shows the interplay between social, political, and economic factors that lead to intensifying pressure on Chinese students today. A girl, whom Fong asked whether she thought singletons were spoiled, thought: “We face great pressure to get into good colleges so we can get good jobs to support our parents when they are old. We’ll have to make a lot of money to support our parents all by ourselves! So

parents are always nagging us to study harder. How can we be spoiled when we're always being scolded for not studying hard enough?" (Fong 2004: 1)

Similarly, faced with an increasingly competitive job market,[19] students in my Guangzhou study continuously worried about their education and their future chances to find good employment.[20] High school students spend the entire last year to prepare for the college entrance examination. They cut short regular school holidays and attend special prep classes on Sundays. Parents exert much pressure on their child to study hard and perform well in the exams, as entrance into key universities still means better chances on the job market. Xiao Mei, aged 15, for example, had felt so oppressed by her parents' expectations that her grades and scores actually went down. Only after the intervention of an older cousin her parents eventually backed off a little and she performed better. But not all students have such understanding parents (or relatives).

Once they entered a good college, it seemed that students had more free time (or, living in dormitories, more freedom). During the semester they could occasionally spare weekends for other activities. Towards the end of the term, however, the stress level rose again and students spent every free minute studying. Moreover, even during vacations, students had assignments or took extra classes. Thus, when students suggested that "feeling bored" was a motivation to volunteer, this probably referred less to excessive spare time than to their rigid schedules, high pressure, and monotonous student lives. In this sense, volunteering could be interpreted as an "escape strategy", a way to break out of the predictability and competitiveness of student life.

This also points to the sociable and entertaining dimension of volunteering: To have fun is an important facet and attraction of the work. In my survey, "it makes me happy" was the second most frequent motivation (15.2 per cent) to continue volunteering, followed by "for my own satisfaction" (8.9 per cent).[21] When students said they volunteered for their own satisfaction, this is of course not necessarily equivalent with having fun. Yet, in interviews informants often (not always) did link these issues. Especially activities organised by JIA involve less concrete tasks and mostly consist of socialising with the HD villagers. In combination with their camp-style organisation, this appears to attract students who are neither necessarily nor primarily interested in helping others. Photos from the outings on the organisation's webpage (http://www.joyinaction.org) reflect the 'camp spirit', the fun and playfulness of the volunteers' experience. This is not to belittle the volunteers' dedication. But the 'fun factor' of the volunteer phenomenon cannot be disregarded, and longer-term volunteers and organisers acknowledged this fact.

The pleasurable facet of volunteering connects to another motivation mentioned in the survey and interviews: "to meet more people" (12.3 per cent as original and 9.5 per cent as continuing motivation). Rigid schedules and regulated student lives apparently do not offer many possibilities to meet people beyond the circle of one's classmates. In addition, two thirds of respondents in my inquiry (and the large majority of urban students in general) are single children and might have a

[19] Even university graduates have more and more difficulties finding qualified employment. Of nearly 5 million young people who graduated in June of 2007, about 1.45 million were still unemployed in the fall, according to a study published in early 2008 by the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences. Researchers estimated that by year-end, about 75 per cent of the recent graduates had found jobs. See *Los Angeles Times*, 18 February, 2008.

[20] Guangzhou graduates' chances also decrease due to their general reluctance to leave the city. Especially in China's west, jobs are available but not sought after due to the location in the economic "hinterland." At least partially, however, this reluctance could also be attributed to a continuously close connection with the family, the ideological obligation to support and care for one's parents, and the much-needed assistance elderly parents can provide with child-care, for example.

[21] The percentages refer to a sample of 42 respondents with multiple answers possible.

heightened need or desire to build meaningful relationships beyond the family realm (see also Rolandsen 2008). Several students without siblings admitted to a certain social isolation, though they most often phrased it in terms of "lacking communicative skills".

Acquiring new skills, in turn, also played an important motivational role to volunteer. 17 respondents (9.5 per cent) checked "to learn new things" as an original motivation to volunteer (10.1 per cent as a continuing motif). An additional 13 (7.3 per cent) wished to increase their respective skills through the activities. Asked to specify what kind of things and skills they wished to acquire, students frequently listed the above mentioned communicational as well as social skills. The importance of this point was further highlighted in the volunteers' reflections on how the experience had affected them: "it increased my interpersonal skills" was one of the two most frequent answers (31 respondents or 18.3 per cent). Equal weight in terms of volunteerism's effects was given to "it has enriched my life". Indeed, many students apparently volunteered because they felt that their lives or they themselves lacked something, a point I will discuss in the following section.

One more factor has to be mentioned: volunteering was also influenced by nationalism, i.e. the students' attitude towards their country. Since the beginning of the reform period, and especially after the Tiananmen Massacre, the CCP has nurtured nationalist sentiments as a means to retain legitimacy (Esteban 2006). More recent research, however, suggests that 'popular nationalism' in China cannot be explained solely as the effect of top-down Party ideology. Chinese nationalism is instead a potent combination of popular sentiment, state authority, and intellectual approval (Guo 2004). In interviews volunteers repeatedly expressed their wish to contribute to China's development by means of improving society and helping the disadvantaged. There was a sense of giving back to society, even if by very simple means such as 'hanging out' with HD villagers.

To summarise, the reasons why young people decide to volunteer are complex and cannot be captured in terms of altruism and self-interest. Instead, they are closely connected to the realities of today's urban environment and living experience. An intense, competitive, and somewhat isolated student life, the desire (and need) to learn new things, to find distraction, and to give life a more meaningful purpose, together with a certain nationalistic enthusiasm to build a modern Chinese society – all of these factors played into the volunteer phenomenon to varying degrees. Most importantly, my survey and interviews revealed that after the students' first concrete volunteering experience their initial motivations changed and the students put less emphasis on their efficacy in helping others or changing something, but on their own change as a person. It is this transformative character of the volunteer experience that I will examine more closely in the next section.

Volunteering as a Technology of the Self

As indicated above, volunteering had a great appeal to the Guangzhou students in my sample as a means to enrich their lives and learn new things. Again and again, students talked about how they had felt "empty" in the past and how they had looked for something "meaningful" to do. Several informants began to read philosophy and psychology books and thought about what it meant to be a person and a member of society. Thus, Tong Li, a 22 year old woman, had read about Mother Teresa and felt inspired by her example of "selfless" giving to others. Zhang Peng, a 25 year old student from Sichuan, in contrast, had developed an elaborate theory of how one only existed as a person in the world if one established and maintained meaningful relations with other people.

The students' "search for meaning" was, on the one hand, probably brought about by the pressures of student life. On the other hand, however, the young volunteers' accounts of how they had come to volunteer and how it affected them pointed at a deeper moral and emotional quest. If Chinese society is characterised by a moral vacuum or deficiency, as stated by Wang (2002) and Zhuo (2001) above and commented on by the students themselves, it is not surprising that the generation of people in their late teens and in their twenties feels the need to form new moralities and values that fit and serve them in the transformed realities of urban life. This "remaking of the moral self" reverberates in what Allahyari (2000) has termed "moral selving" – the work of creating oneself as a more virtuous, and often more spiritual, person. Volunteering, in this sense, is an important realm, an arena where young people can develop and/or apply moral values. As an expression of the young generations' newly formed identities and ideologies, volunteering also implicitly contradicts the "get rich quickly" dictum of many Chinese people today. It transcends the market-driven, consumer-oriented ideology that the Chinese government propagates.

Yet, in the interviews, the Guangzhou volunteers invariably expressed the need to change and to transform themselves, to create a new self or identity that went beyond the moral realm. Jian Xiaoting (female, age 22), for example, described the transformation she experienced through her volunteer work like this:

> "In the beginning, I just wanted to help others. However, after doing volunteer work several times, I found I could only help very little, but it helped me more instead. It made me make new friends. And since I am an introvert, it made me become more active and now I know better how to communicate with others. Besides, by doing volunteer work, I realised that I lack much knowledge and it makes me study harder."

To a certain extent, the perceived need to transform oneself probably is just a part of the coming-of-age process. Nonetheless, repeated references to alleged negative personality traits hint at something more. Various students suggested that they were too "introvert", that they "lacked social skills", or were "not good at communicating." In addition, "to learn new things" and "to improve my skills" were important motivations to begin, and especially to continue, to volunteer. While students did not put this in so many words, these are skills and requirements necessary in today's (urban) Chinese society and especially in finding a job on the increasingly more competitive labour market. Thus, volunteering was also a means to address these perceived shortcomings. Through the volunteer work students could develop and improve themselves. But this was not a simple cost-benefit equation. After all, "it will help me find a job" was *not* a reason to volunteer. In the interviews, informants expressed that they were likely to hide the fact they had volunteered once they sought a job because employers might – similar to the students' parents – consider it negatively, as a waste of time.[22] In effect, the transformation of self into a new, competitive persona through volunteering was a deeply personal yet holistic endeavour. Beyond expressing a newly found morality, volunteerism was a means to refashion the self into a modern subject. To a certain extent, one could consider the students' self-transformation into modern subjects, their refashioning of self, and endeavour to acquire new skills, to be a form of self-support: in a highly competitive (urban) environment, they are readying themselves to be self-reliant, productive, and

[22] Surveys of the public reception of volunteering recurrently reveal a lack of understanding. See Guangzhou Youth Volunteer Association 2006.

functional subjects. The phenomenon is thus deeply embedded in, and constitutive of, the state's project of modernisation – an observation which brings us back to the issue of social support.

Volunteering as a Technology of Power

The students' own perceived personality 'flaws' reflected the internalised rationale behind and discourse about China's new socio-economic system and personhood. But the volunteer phenomenon also reveals the transformed relation between citizen and state as regards relations of social support.

With the restructuring of the socialist welfare state the government's interest is to transform citizens from supplicants to the state into consumers of market-based social services. Despite a basic social security system in urban areas, hardship can easily arise in and through various circumstances (e.g. medical expenses in case of sickness, frail elderly people who need practical and financial support, unemployment, children's education, purchase of a new house, rising costs of living). In all these situations, resources have to be mobilised by the individual. It is here where kin and other social relations gain increasing importance. But it is also here where volunteerism can help to fill the gap left by the cut in state-provided services. In the government's vision, the 'reformed' subject (i.e. reform-period subject) thus should be self-reliant, proactive, but also responsible – for herself and for others. This new kind of state-society relation is realised, for example, through urban reforms such as the building of *shequ* (community). *Shequ* is a physical and social unit of organisation that is intended to (partially) replace the wide-ranging welfare function that employers (*danwei*) held during the Maoist period. *Shequ* is built on the urban residents' participation and voluntary contribution. Concurrently, the official discourse of *suzhi* (quality) emphasises the individual's need to develop and improve itself, to increase its human capital. As Anagnost (2008: 512) puts it: "The body [has become] a site of investment through an entrepreneurialisation of the self. The politics of *suzhi* is the local form in which neoliberal technologies of selfhood take shape in the Chinese context." In fact, today government units promote community service and volunteering through a discourse, which blends concepts of cultural competence and self-realisation with a concern for the common good. Volunteering is officially promoted as a means to develop the self, i.e. to gain cultural capital (Rolandsen 2008: 125). It is in this sense that I suggest that the volunteer phenomenon is a 'technology' in a dual sense: for the students, on the one hand, it is a technology of self by means of which they refashion their identity into functional subjects in China's urban society. For the state, on the other hand, it is a technology of power used to tap into students' enthusiasm as a source of social welfare while concomitantly supporting the evolution of a 'reformed' modern subject.

Between Technology of Self and Technology of Power

Volunteering in contemporary urban China can thus be seen as both a technology of self and a technology of power. Yet, I do not want to sound deterministic or overemphasise this 'functionalist' interpretation. On the one hand, the state project is only partially successful as government slogans are largely met with cynicism.[23] On the other, volunteering also simply made

[23] At the same time, however, volunteer organisations associated with the state are popular among young people because they are considered "safe".

students "happy". The volunteers (mostly) seemed to genuinely enjoy their work and find satisfaction in their activities. More importantly, volunteer activities provide a real social service.

In the course of my research, I visited a privately supported, district-run senior citizen home.[24] Located in a modern new building in Guangzhou's outskirts and surrounded by a small garden, it lay next to a recently finished four lane highway and could only be reached by car or bus. Inside the building, hallways and communal rooms were bright and clean. The elderly lived in rooms of four to eight people that only held their beds and small closets. The director and one female resident, who I was allowed to interview, both claimed that all residents had freely chosen to live in the home. They denied any conflicts between children and elderly parents. To entertain residents, the professional staff organised various activities and most elderly were visited at least once per week by their relatives. Nonetheless, it was clear when I was there that it was visits from volunteers that brought distraction, personal attention, and laughter to the place. In several rooms groups of elderly sat and chatted with young people who, organised by GYVA, visited the place regularly.

No matter how mundane or small the effects of their activities, student volunteers not only fill a void that was (to a certain extent) formerly attended to by the state, but also offer something else: compassion. In an increasingly individualistic and materialistic environment with a diagnosed moral deficiency, this likely means a lot to both the students who volunteer and to their 'clients'. In the above case, for example, for elderly who did not have family or were neglected by them, as reportedly happens more and more often, the volunteers' visits definitely improved their every-day living experience and thus had a positive effect.

At the same time, volunteers break out of the traditional 'inner circle' of social relations and support through their work, even if only relatively few of them build long lasting relationships with 'clients'. More importantly, the help and support young volunteers provided was not founded on expectations of reciprocity. On the contrary, several informants commented that volunteering was a way to "pay back to society". Leo, a former JIA volunteer, for example, felt that his work with the HD villagers was a way to give back: "When I was in middle school and high school, many people helped me. I feel receiving help from others is not enough [one cannot just *receive* help]. I had spare time [when I was] in university which I could spend helping others." But when I asked him why he did not help his relatives and people in his hometown, he explained:

> "Money is the most effective way to help them, but that is beyond my current abilities. The situation of the HD villagers is different. Money is not the most important to them. They just hope that people come, visit, and talk to them. They are quite lonely. (…) We can bring them hope that encourages them to live. (…) Though I cannot give back to those who helped me, I can do something for others in society. Maybe it's not enough, but it's at least something."

Thus, while volunteering served the students as a means to transform themselves and the state to nurture responsible, modern citizens, at the same time, it was a practice that gave meaning, created happiness, and established social relationships beyond 'functionalist' frames.

Reflecting on economic patterns of organisation, Marshall Sahlins (1972) identified three different kinds of reciprocity: generalised, balanced, and negative. Generalised reciprocity describes virtually uninhibited sharing or giving. It occurs when one person shares goods or labour

[24] This institution was recommended as exemplary by street-office cadres of one of the oldest neighbourhoods in Guangzhou. Here, I was initially warmly welcomed, shown around, and granted an interview with the director and a resident of her choice. Permission for further interviews and visits, however, was denied.

with another person without expecting anything in return. Balanced or symmetrical reciprocity occurs when someone gives to someone else and expects a fair and tangible return at some undefined future date. It is a very informal system of exchange. The expectation that the giver will be repaid is based on trust and social consequences. Somebody who does not adhere to these unwritten rules will find it harder and harder to obtain favours. Negative reciprocity, finally, refers to exchanges in which a person gives goods or labour and receives an immediate return in form of other goods or labour of the same value.

Borrowing from this typology of reciprocity, I suggest calling the Guangzhou volunteers' work 'generalised support', that is, a form of support that is not based on expectations of a return and where the 'pay-off' for the giver is satisfaction and a social bond. Due to the usually short-term activities, for the Guangzhou volunteers in my study this social bond can only be the one with other volunteers. At the same time, however, an added benefit for them is the opportunity to refashion themselves into 'modern subjects' through their volunteer activities.

Conclusion

In this article I examined the recent popularity of volunteering in urban China as a complex phenomenon that is inspired by a multitude of factors, including students' desire to break out of their daily routines and meet more people, a search for meaningful lives, but also contributing to the development of their country. These cannot be meaningfully distinguished into altruistic and self-interested motifs. Examining volunteering in the larger context of China's transformations, I show that instead it is both a technology of self and a technology of power. Whereas students use volunteering to transform themselves into competitive subjects in the urban labour market, the state encourages it as part of its effort to transfer welfare responsibilities from the employer to the individual and to socially engineer self-responsible, modern citizens. Beyond this, however, volunteering is also simply a social practice that brings happiness, shows compassion, and builds social relations. It is from this perspective that I suggest conceptualising volunteer work as a form of 'generalised support'.

References

Adloff, F. and S. Sigmund. 2005. Die *gift economy* moderner Gesellschaften. Zur Soziologie der Philanthrophie. In: F. Adloff and S. Mau (eds.). *Vom Geben und Nehmen. Zur Soziologie der Reziprozität*. Frankfurt: Campus, pp. 211–235.

Allahyari, R.A. 2000. *Visions of Charity: volunteer work and moral communities.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Anagnost, A. 2008. From 'Class' to 'Social Strata': grasping the social totality in reform-era China. *Third World Quarterly* 29(3): 497–519.

Asianphilanthropy.org. 2006. *Asian Philanthropy*. Electronic document. http://www.asianphilanthropy.org/index.html.

Chandler, C. 2004. Little Emperors. Electronic document. http://money.cnn.com/magazines/fortune.

China Statistics Press. 2004. *Guangzhou Statistical Yearbook 2004*. Beijing: China Statistics Press.

China Statistics Press. 2006. *Guangdong Statistical Yearbook 2006.* Beijing: China Statistics Press.

Ding Y. 2005. China's Campus Volunteerism and Its Enabling Environment. *China Volunteer Service Journal*, English Edition, pp. 4–15.

Ding Y. and X. Jiang. 2001. *Volunteering Service: types, evaluation and management.* Tianjin: Tianjin People's Press.

Esteban, M. 2006. The Management of Nationalism During the Jiang Era (1994–2000) and Its Implications on Government and Regime Legitimacy. *European Journal of East Asian Studies* 5(2): 181–214.

Fong, V. 2004. *Only Hope. Coming of age under China's one child policy.* Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Foucault, M. 1980. *The History of Sexuality. Volume 1: an introduction.* New York: Vintage.

Guangzhou Youth Volunteer Association (ed.). 2006. *Research Report about Guangzhou Citizens' Recognition of Volunteer Services* [guangzhou shimin dui yiwugongzuo renzhi zhuangkuang]. Electronic document, http://www.1205.cn/report (In Chinese).

Guo Y. 2004. *Cultural Nationalism in Contemporary China: the search for national identity.* London: Routledge Curzon.

Joy-in-Action. n.d. *Joy-in-Action*. Electronic document, http://www.joyinaction.org.

Juknevičius, S. and A. Savicka. 2003. From Restitution to Innovation. Volunteering in postcommunist countries. In: P. Dekker and L. Halman (eds.). *The Values of Volunteering. Cross-cultural perspectives.* Nonprofit and Civil Society Studies. New York: Kluwer Academic/Plenum Publishers, pp. 127–142.

Kwong, J. 1994. Ideological Crisis among China's Youths: values and official ideology. *The British Journal of Sociology* 45(2): 247–264.

Los Angeles Times. 2008. *Degree No Job Guarantee in China.* Electronic document, http://articles.latimes.com/2008/feb/18/business/fi-chinajobs18, February 18.

Madge, C. 1974. The Relevance of Family Patterns in the Process of Modernization in East Asia. In: R.J. Smith (ed.). *Social Organization and the Applications of Anthropology*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, pp. 164 ff.

Nesbitt-Larking, P. and A.L. Chan. 1997. Chinese Youth and Civil Society. The emergence of critical citizenship. In: T. Brook and B.M. Frolic (eds.). *Civil Society in China.* Armonk: M.E. Sharp, pp. 149–172.

Rolandsen, U.H. Målfrid. 2008. A Collective of Their Own: young volunteers at the fringes of the party realm. *European Journal of East Asian Studies* 7(1): 101–129.

Sahlins, M. 1972. On the Sociology of Primitive Exchange. In: M. Sahlins. *Stone Age Economics.* Chicago: Aldine, pp. 185–276.

Ślęzak, E. 2005. Voluntary Work in Contemporary Poland. Volunteers and beneficiaries. In: F. Pine and H. Haukanes (eds.). *Social Security, Vulnerability and People at Risk: gender and generation in the former socialist countries of Europe and Central Asia*. University of Bergen: Centre for Women's and Gender Research, pp. 69–96.

Stafford, C. 2000. Chinese Patriliny and the Cycles of *yang* and *laiwang*. In: J. Carsten (ed.). *Cultures of Relatedness.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 35–54.

Tan J. (ed.). 2006. *Zhongguo guangdong zhiyuan fuwu fazhan baogao* [Volunteer Service in Guangdong China development report]. Guangdong: Guangdong renmin chubanshe [Guangdong People's Publishing Society].

Tang W. 2005. *Public Opinion and Political Change in China*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Wang X. 2002. The Post-Communist Personality. The spectre of China's capitalist market reforms. *The China Journal* 47: 1–17.

Whyte, M.K. 1997. The Fate of Filial Obligations in Urban China. *The China Journal* 38: 1–31.

Zhuo X. 2001. Religion and Morality in Contemporary China. *Studies in World Christianity* 7(1): 34–41.